



Hawai'i Convention Center
1801 Kalākaua Avenue, Honolulu, Hawai'i 96815
kelepona tel 808 973 2255
kelepa'i fax 808 973 2253
kahua pa'a web hawaii-tourism-authority.org

David Y. Ige
Governor

John De Fries
President and Chief Executive Officer

**HO'OKAHUA HAWAII STANDING COMMITTEE MEETING
HAWAII TOURISM AUTHORITY
Tuesday, February 15, 2022, at 3:00 p.m.
VIRTUAL MEETING**

MINUTES OF HO'OKAHUA HAWAII STANDING COMMITTEE MEETING

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Kimi Yuen (Chair), Keone Downing (Vice Chair) Daniel Chun, Dylan Ching, George Kam, Sig Zane

MEMBER NOT PRESENT:

HTA STAFF PRESENT:

John De Fries, Keith Regan, Kalani Ka'anā'anā, Caroline Anderson, Maka Casson-Fisher, Dede Howa, Ilihia Gionson, Ross Willkom, Irina De La Torre, Jadie Goo, Minh Chau Chun, Carole Hagihara, Iwalani Kahoohanohano, Michele Shiwaki, Yvonne Lam, Todd Toguchi, Sunnie Lasconia,

GUESTS:

Sue Kanoho, Sherry Duong, Meagan DeGaia, Ross Birch, Rachel Kaiama, Noelani Schilling-Wheeler, Catherine Orlans, Patti Ornellas, Jennifer Chun, David Arakawa, Kyoko Kimura, JoAnn Inamasu, Kurt Yaross, Gina Chun, John White, Erin Khan, Donna Kimura, Karen Wataru Nakaoka, Karishma Chowfin, Teri Orton, Joyce Bernardo, Patti Ornellas, Celine Daclison, Susie Kim, Debbie Hogan, Darlene Morikawa, Laci Goshi, Nalani Kathleen Brun, Justin Nakaahiki

LEGAL COUNSEL:

Gregg Kinkley

1. Call to Order and Pule

Chair Yuen called the meeting to order at 3:00 p.m. Mr. Casson-Fisher opened the meeting with a pule and did a roll call, and all members confirmed they were by themselves.

2. Approval of Minutes of the December 13, 2021, Meeting

Mr. Kam made a motion to approve, and Mr. Chun seconded. Mr. Casson-Fisher did a roll call and the motion passed unanimously.

3. Updates from the Four Island Chapters and its Destination Managers on Key Projects/Activities for 2022

Chair Yuen asked Ms. Anderson, Director of Planning, to go over the agenda item. She said the Destination Managers will be presenting 2022 activities. She thanked all the Destination Managers and Executive Directors of the island chapters, for being great partners in moving each island's Destination Management Action Plan forward. She said the presentations will share the hard work they have done and will be doing in 2022.

Ms. Kanoho, the Executive Director of Kaua'i Visitors Bureau (KVB), said they have done a lot in a few months since October 2021 and they are looking forward to the rest of the year. She handed it over to Ms. Ornellas, the Destination Manager of the KVB.

Ms. Ornellas shared a few of their 2022 key projects and activities for Kaua'i. Their first project is the Mālama Kaua'i videos - on the same lines as the Mālama Hawai'i videos, which focus on connecting the visitor with the culture before arrival and while on the island.

She said Mālama Kaua'i is curated to educate and promote awareness of their culture and natural resources, with the focus on Kaua'i specifically. She said there are videos in progress - Kaua'i Museum, Mo'olelo Murals, National Tropical Botanical Gardens, Prince Kūhlō Park - they are all culturally based, and it is a grass roots effort and she hopes the videos will capture the essence of Kaua'i and not only cater to visitors, but engage with the island community too. She said they are excited about the process.

She spoke about the Community Enrichment Program and with the support of the HTA she said they are able to fund 18 Kaua'i specific events and an additional three statewide events that will take place on Kaua'i. She said starting that weekend they have one of the awardees, the Waimea Town Celebration, which is a community event lasting over eight days.

She said many of their awardees are in the early stages of preparing for the events coming up in the next few months and the summer, so she thanked HTA for their support. She spoke about another key project, promoting Shop Local. She said Alakoko is a store that they hope will be a one-place-shop featuring products made by local crafters, vendors and artisans. She said they

also have a website featuring the products that are available to purchase online, and the Kaua'i made products will be a part of the storefront. She said they have updated their website and it will continue to be updated to engage a more current and digital forward view on the Kaua'i made products website.

She said to ensure the same messaging is conveyed, they are working with the State DLNR and County as a result of many illegal activities and the lack of permits, such as illegal wedding photography. A Zoom meeting will be held Friday, February 18, which will focus on best practices for commercial activity in State and County parts - the call will be recorded and posted by DLNR.

She shared some insights, their challenges and opportunities. She mentioned wildlife endangerment, and their challenges on how to best inform their tour operators and local fisherman on pono practices for recreation. She said she is currently working with the Kaua'i representative to the Board for STAH (Sustainable Tourism Association of Hawai'i), Holo Holo Charters and they hope to have a meeting by May to address this with local fishermen and tour operators. They are hoping to work with DLNR to help move this forward and have a meeting for the specific topic.

For forestry management, the challenge is to advocate for intentional inspection and enforcement of camping and hiking gear. She is currently working with the Kaua'i Invasive Species Committee (KISC) discussing how they can improve the procedures in place for hiking and the ROD (Rapid Ohia Death) problem.

For the cultural hui engagement, their challenge is not having a working relationship with an established hui of cultural leaders, advisors and practitioners on Kaua'i; on the contrary, they have many supporting agencies that help. They are hoping they can bring a hui together, through the DMAP, which will help springboard all cultural activities on the island.

She spoke about traffic being a challenge on Kaua'i and the opportunity to address the issue by joining the Energy Transitions Initiative Partnership Program (ETIPP) to focus on the east side of Kaua'i. She said there are discussions to have an information center and mobility hub in Waipouli and she has already been in contact with the hui who is in the process of working on the project.

Ms. Duong, the Executive Director from the Maui Visitors Bureau, said they are excited to have the opportunity to share their progress with Maui Nui DMAP. She said Ms. DeGaia has been with them longer than the other DMAP managers and has made great strides - being with them for six months and doing a great job.

She turned it over to Ms. DeGaia, the DMAP manager. Ms. DeGaia thanked everyone and said she is excited to share some of the work they have been doing at the Maui Visitors and Convention Bureau. She started with Maui DMAP Action B.1, which involves promoting Hawai'i's sunscreen law and educating visitors about proper sunscreen being used through visitor education programs.

She said the main thing they will be doing in the coming months is seeking to install Raw Elements mineral based sunscreens at several locations throughout Maui, Lāna'i and Moloka'i. They will be free for visitor and public use and placed in conspicuous places, which is a win for the 'āina, for coral reef ecology, and for the public at large. They have learned that free samples of the product drives long term positive consumer behavior, so it will help their retailers as well. This product helps the coral reef to rebound, regrow, and come back, even after 90 days of limitation of chemical sunscreens being in the water - great for industry, coral reefs and residents. She said they will be working with DLNR and County on it.

Action B.4 of their DMAP calls for providing incentives to the industry to reduce their ecological footprint. It is similar to mineral based sunscreen dispensers they are installing through the partnership with the Surfrider Foundation, and will also be partnering with them for their Rise Above Plastics program to reduce single-use plastics among condo vacation rental complexes as well.

Action B for Maui's DMAP - the overarching action - pertains to funding programs that protect the health of their oceans, freshwater, land-based ecosystems and biosecurity in general.

She said later in the year as a follow up to the capacity building workshop study, HTA will be putting out an RFP to local nonprofits in the East Maui area and seeking to award multiple nonprofits in the hope that they can provide and implement comprehensive community driven management plans to help manage hotspots and the issues that have arisen along the road to Hana and East Maui.

Ms. DeGaia said they are excited about the Mālama Hawai'i program in Maui Nui, and they are working hard to strengthen the program, as they believe it is an important way that they can channel tourism and visitors to be stewards of the land and unite with them to embody the value of Mālama that they all care about. She said in an effort to fulfil Maui Action D, which is to develop regenerative tourism initiatives, they have fourteen nonprofit partners in their Mālama Hawai'i program. She said in 2021 they hosted separate webinars to strengthen the program - one was for non-profits, and one was for industry. She said they are continually prospecting additional organizations to join the program.

She mentioned Leilani Farm Sanctuary - one of their non-profits in their program where visitors can help take care of farm animals that have been rescued and are in a sanctuary. She mentioned other participating non-profits who welcome visitors to engage in culturally based ecological restoration - beach clean ups, sea turtle nest watch and more unique opportunities. Ms. DeGaia shared Maui's opportunities and challenges - their challenges include ensuring longevity of programs through ongoing funding, and needing industry to have more involvement, embracing and owning the Mālama Hawai'i program. She said they are excited about the opportunities on the horizon which include fostering relationships with Hawaiian cultural practitioners. She said they believe it will be key to the success of implementing the Destination Management Action Plan.

For the Island of Moloka'i - Moloka'i Action C.1 is to form the Moloka'i advisory group, one of her highest priorities when she started her role in August 2021. She said the purpose of the advisory group is to provide messaging and guidance about responsible behavior when visitors arrive on the islands. She said they have ten members, all Moloka'i residents, on the advisory group, and they are very excited and want to be part of implementing the DMAP.

Moloka'i Action E.1 is about revitalizing infrastructure, which is on their radar. She said Moloka'i residents are passionate about the revitalization of the Mālama Cultural Park. She said it is in a key area that people pass through in the industrial area on the way to Kaunakakai town. She said they support the revitalization of Mālama Cultural Park, so they are engaged with G70 and in conversations with DHHL to support this so that it can be a positive place for residents, and visitors can interact in meaningful ways.

Moloka'i B.3 - supporting the Mālama Hawai'i program. She said currently they have one Mālama Hawai'i partner on Moloka'i, the Moloka'i Land Trust. She showed some photos from restoration work on the island and said they are in communications with Ka Honua Momona, 'Āina Momona, Hotel Moloka'i, and reaching out to Sustainable Moloka'i as well, in the hopes of bringing even more non-profit organizations into the Mālama Hawai'i family so that visitors who come to Moloka'i have many options to give back during their stay.

The opportunity and challenge on Moloka'i is building trust with the community. They are thankful for their Moloka'i advisory group, the value of transparency, being part of the process, and value whole community participation action. It is important to be a unified front as they recognize their needs and are doing their best to meet them, so they can build and earn trust.

She said they also value models of tourism with high community benefit and control. They see a lot of opportunity of win-win in the area where they can work with the Mālama Hawai'i program and all the actions in the DMAP to bring it to fruition.

She moved onto the island of Lānaʻi; similar to the island of Molokaʻi Action E.1, which called them to convene with the Lānaʻi advisory group. She said their Lānaʻi advisory group has 15 members, all Lānaʻi residents. She said Action E in general is the heart of what the advisory group's work is for the island Lānaʻi and centers on promoting Lānaʻi City to increase spending that goes to residents and small businesses, and truly community-driven initiatives.

She said they met with the Lānaʻi advisory group and had a productive working session with them at the end of October where they brainstormed a new brand identity and the messaging to educate the visitors about who they are and who Lānaʻi City is. She said they shared the feedback at the Lānaʻi community meeting that they hosted. They received even more feedback, then went back to the advisory group, and will be working together with HVCB to create an update of brand identity for Lānaʻi that is fully in support of their local economy.

Lānaʻi Action E.2 and G.2 hit on a number of actions. She said they have developed a day trip call Mālama Lānaʻi, which is a service day trip as part of the Mālama Hawaiʻi program through Sail Trilogy's Blue ʻĀina campaign. It will be a day trip that is open to visitors, including kamaʻaina visitors, where people can head over from Lahaina on Trilogy. She said they will receive food and beverage as well as ecological, cultural, and historical orientations before arriving and then be taken by Pūlama Lānaʻi to do ecological restoration work and learn more about the culture.

She said Hawaiian protocol will be woven throughout the experience as well so they can learn about the significance and importance of their Hawaiʻi cultural protocols. They will also have a chance to go to Lānaʻi City to shop and support the economy and said they are working closely with the Lānaʻi advisory group to come up with the messaging that is shared on the boat and throughout the experience. There will be a coordinated effort through the tri-partnership that they have with Sail Trilogy, Pūlama Lānaʻi and Expeditions Ferry.

Ms. DeGaia reported that they are also working to bring Lānaʻi Cat Sanctuary into the program - working to save cats. She reiterated that it is also important with regards to conservation to protect bird species.

She said encouraging sustainable tourism practices on Lānaʻi is very important to residents. They are working with the Division of Aquatic Resources to support the 30x30 benchmarks and that conversations on this will begin over the summer. The objective will be to manage 30% of nearshore waters statewide by 2030. She said the call for them to be part of this comes from an informal group that has arisen as an offspring of the Lānaʻi advisory group. The focus is to limit the use of commercial vessels going to Lānaʻi and the current state of snorkeling.

The opportunities for the Lānaʻi DMAP have been very positive as they are building a strong relationship with the Lānaʻi community and building trust in a positive way so they can support the local economy and the ʻāina.

For the challenges they foresee, as they embark on discussions with the Division of Aquatic Resources, they are expecting pushback from Maui commercial vessels as they seek to limit commercial snorkel activity in Lānaʻi waters, as part of respecting the wishes of the Lānaʻi residents.

Mr. Birch, the Executive Director from the Island of Hawaiʻi Visitors Bureau introduced himself. He said he echoes the sentiment of his sister chapters as they are excited and enthusiastic about the DMAP and their participation in it. He said they started their plan in early 2021, but they were not able to onboard a Destination Manager until mid-November, so they are pleased to have Ms. Kaiama on board with them.

He turned it over to Ms. Kaiama. Ms. Kaiama thanked everyone and said she is honored to serve. She began on November 15 to manage and support the actions identified by the Hawaiʻi Island steering committee, and their vision and foresight with the kokua of HTA. She said in the ten actions they came up with there are 43 subactions that focus on community and land-based education programs that protect and preserve natural resources in sacred places, preserves Hawaiian culture and values, and improves resident sentiment, and supports authentic visitor experiences.

Ms. Kaiama reported there are three specific focuses she is working on. First, Action A protects and preserves culturally significant places and hotspots. They are focusing on coming together and developing a community facility event/activity in specific areas.

She said they currently have the Pololū Valley Pilot project which is a good model for them to work with. The partnership with HTA, KUPU and DLNR and the community-based information, as well as the safety officers and stewards, are impactful and helpful in sharing information about the ahupuaʻa and surrounding areas, mitigating unwanted behavior, providing information that helps keep visitors safe and offers a base model for them to use for other community programs that they are going to be focusing on, including Waipiʻo Valley, where community-driven conversations are underway.

She said they are excited to bring the communities together to talk about some of the concerns they have for Waipiʻo Valley. They are in the planning stages, working with a moderator and group facilitator to allow the community to address key concerns and come up with solutions.

She said they are also initiating dialogue with DHHL and beneficiaries about having community engagement for Papakolea Greensand Beach. She said much of the community work they anticipate will take time to nurture, coordinate and facilitate, maybe four months. This effort will foster change and encourage engagement with their communities and give opportunities for them to come together in the spirit of community to Mālama and Aloha 'Āina to address concerns.

Second, Action E creates opportunities for ongoing dialogue, communication and engagement between the visitor industry, government and communities to improve community-industry relationships. She said the Hawaiian Island Actions A and B emphasize preservation of Hawaiian culture and values in the travel and tourism industry for guests and kama'aina. She said it is important to understand and share what the communities are doing in providing workshops and training for guests and employees where the learning gaps are, and finding the resources and programs to fill the puka and communicate good words about what stakeholders collectively do to preserve and promote Hawaiian culture and values.

She said that is what they hope to do with the hotels and resorts on the Kohala Coast and Kona and the Hawaiian cultural practitioners, and to gain an understanding what land-based Hawaiian culture learning is occurring for visitors and employees. She said they are also doing Mālama Hawai'i, preparing for orientation for non-profit and for-profit voluntourism programs. She said it is a big push and effort for DMAP initiatives around Hawaiian culture and land-based educational programs for visitors and kama'aina to learn about their culture and communities.

She said they have not started on action J, to improve enforcement of vacation rental regulations, but have several ideas that they are working on, and they will be working with the County to learn about the vacation rental inventory, permitted versus and unpermitted, and to improve enforcement of vacation rental regulations.

Ms. Kaiama shared the opportunities on Hawai'i DMAP are to develop community consensus for managing natural resources, sacred places, and places they love, which includes going out to the community, having meetings where everyone can get involved in talking about solutions to problems and hotspots. The other opportunity is to develop the landscape of Hawaiian cultural programs for visitors and employees to understand what is out there and to communicate to stakeholders that there is a lot already going on in their hotel and hospitality industry, which promotes Hawaiian culture and values, and educates tourists and communities and kama'aina. Another opportunity is to develop networks of support for Hawai'i Island DMAP initiatives, where it is speaking to community, or through community enrichment programs, where they are encouraging more people to get to know about the DMAP initiative and the actions taking place on the island.

Ms. Kaiama shared the challenges they are facing, looking for continuous support for current successful programs. One example is Pololū Valley and the importance of a self-sustaining programs. Programs like this need the community support to extend their longevity. She said what happens in that program will affect all the other programs going forward. She said they also need time to develop community consensus and programs to help communities identify the problems, come up with solutions and take action.

She said another challenge is that Hawai'i island is large, and travel is required to engage in the communities to understand the dynamics of distance and people getting involved.

Ms. Schilling-Wheeler, the Executive Director of O'ahu Visitors Bureau, reported the O'ahu DMAP was only recently finalized at the end of August and the O'ahu Destination Manager started in mid-September. She introduced Ms. Orlans, the Destination Manager for O'ahu.

Ms. Orlans reported the key projects they are working on for the O'ahu DMAP, which focuses on Anchor Action I, managing the visitors' use of cars as transportation. She said they have been collaborating closely with the City and County of Honolulu. She said they had meetings with the Mayor's Office, who did a great job collaborating with all his department heads and allowing OVB to present on the O'ahu DMAPs, so there was a lot of buy-in within the City.

She said they are closely working with OER, DTS, CCSR and DPR, with some of their efforts around Complete Streets, part of the O'ahu Pedestrian Plan, specifically focusing on where they are doing the work, so they are not duplicating efforts. She spoke about another idea they came up with, which stemmed from a project out of the Kaua'i DMAP, and they worked with their County to get approval to have a similar website to their Get Around Kaua'i website, which stemmed from issues of transportation in the pandemic. O'ahu's will have more focus on alternative modes of transportation, focusing on the City's goals for that.

She said they are also working on the GoHawai'i app and beacons to create more awareness for visitors in Waikiki about the best route on Kūhiō Avenue, as well as working with some of the private tour companies on the island to encourage new types of tourist experiences to help rebalance some of the traffic on the island.

Anchor Action C is identifying the sites and implementing stewardship plans for the hotspots. OVB is working closely with the City on hotspots, focusing their efforts on Hanauma Bay, making sure that the reservation system is in place, everything is set, and they can implement it at other locations on island.

She said they are also looking at beacon programs at different spots around the island to help with some of the messaging around visitor movement and a range of actions related to

hotspots. She said they are also determining with HVCB's marketing program if their new WAZE app messaging can support the GoHawai'i app and influence visitor movement around the island.

She said next up in the year is collaborating with DLNR statewide to see what projects are underway and determining possible additional improvements that can help visitors and residents alike.

Since she started in the Fall, a big focus had been around Action A, lowering the number of illegal short-term vacation rentals by supporting the city's improvement to enforce the current regulations. She said that Bill 41 CD1 is currently going through the process of becoming a law at the City level, so they have been working closely with HTA and supporting the City's effort through constant communication and testimony from industry partners as well.

Action B is implementing the pre- and post-arrival tourism communication program. This is where the kuleana and mālama messaging comes into play, and Ms. Orlans said it is grounded in their direction from HTA around the Mālama Ku'u Home messaging. She said they want to make sure the messaging is reaching visitors all along the way, and they are working with GMTs around the globe to make sure they push out consistent messaging for O'ahu.

She said they are reviewing opportunities with the existing GoHawai'i app and other consumer-facing platforms to help with the messaging, some of which includes translation that they are working on with GMT's. Last summer, education messaging was needed, and they have been working closely with NOAA around education for federally protected animals, as well as for offshore hotspots, such as the Waianae Coast and Kāne'ohe Bay.

She said they continue to focus on supporting NaHHA and HTA with industry efforts for continuing cultural education and training programs.

The key focus in 2022 is the community enrichment program, which touches upon O'ahu Action J, working with community partners to develop, market, encourage and support more collaborative, curated experiences that enrich residents and visitors. She said on O'ahu they have 21 programs and events. She said the unique offerings help the community and also increase the number of authentic experiences they can offer to visitors, with the big focus on shifting visitors to non-peak season periods.

The challenges they have had are the need for continuous education and buy-in from stakeholders. She said they found it necessary to continue the ongoing effort, as O'ahu has a vast network of stakeholders and communities.

She spoke about product maturity; they have a large number of residents and visitors competing for the same resources and traffic is also an issue for visitors and residents. She also mentioned another challenge is the availability of cultural experiences on the island. She said there is uncertainty with continuous support and funding for the community, industry, government DMAP initiatives, and the timeline for the DMAP is only three years, but some of the City projects are about five years. They are trying to complete projects within the DMAP timeline while working with the City's timelines.

Ms. Orlans shared the opportunities - building trust and relationships with various non-industry communities, i.e., working outside the visitor industry. She also mentioned an opportunity to elevate their cultural and environmental exchange and engagement with stakeholders through collaboration with community, industry, and government. They are trying to support community led initiatives with service and training in the community. She said it helps give the community a voice in management of areas, and helps voluntourism and ecotourism by creating more authentic cultural experiences where they have challenges. Lastly, opportunities to help diversify their economy by supporting other industries that are complementary with the visitor industry, focusing on Made and Grown in Hawai'i products and the film industry.

Ms. Anderson asked if there were any questions from the committee members.

Chair Yuen thanked everyone for their presentation. She thanked Ms. Anderson and acknowledged her team of Island chapters, whose community outreach work had been amazing, considering most of them have only been on the job for a few months.

Mr. Chun wanted to build on what Chair Yuen said about getting the message out there, what work has been done, and that there has been a lot of work planned for the future. He asked if there was any type of outreach or engagement with members of the Legislature with regards to the process. He said it would be great to hear from each of them regarding their plans, as he said it seems vague as to what has been done so far.

Mr. Regan said they are actively having conversations with various legislators and said it would be important for them to get the managers in front of key legislators, particularly their Tourism Chairs, as well as Ways and Means and Finance Committee Chairs who are instrumental in providing funding to support HTA and their mission. He said to Mr. Chun's point, there are the DMAP managers on each of the islands who have important messages to deliver to their legislators, and they will coordinate that. He mentioned that in meetings with legislators, they have been making it clear about all the great work going on. He said HTA did not invite all the liaisons from the islands to participate, but thinks it is a great idea.

Mr. Chun said it is a key piece and knows that HTA has been communicating that in all their meetings, but he thinks it is essential for the legislators to hear directly from each of the managers who are doing the work, and encourages them to set it up sooner rather than later, as they are at a critical time. In the legislative session, with some of the key measures moving forward in the session.

He added that prior to the destination managers going to make the presentations, it is important to prioritize what they are focusing on. He said it would be nice to see in the presentation, looking at the DMAP as a map, the overall feedback and actions, and picking out the ones to focus on for the year, and why they are prioritizing it, just to see how it fits into the grand scheme of the plan as funding and resources are constant issues. He said they have to be thoughtful how they attack the plan while talking to the decision makers.

Chair Yuen said to build on that idea, HTA needs to have all the legislators of all the islands hear it too. Given what happened in the last legislative session, they must try to get in front of each one so that each island's set of legislators are also invested and supportive of what they are all doing.

Mr. De Fries agreed that HTA should meet and present to each island caucus so they can support it, in addition to what Mr. Regan and Mr. Chun focused on, the power committees.

He also thanked the DMAP managers, as they could sense the passion they bring to their work. The passion is driven by the fact that they live in the communities and they are accountable to the communities. One piece of advice received from the Senate WAM chairman Dela Cruz is to create the MOU between HTA and county mayors. Although Mr. De Fries and the county mayors did not think an MOU was necessary because the mayors have had working relationships with HTA. However, HTA is moving to execute the MOU with each county. He said Mr. Chun raised a timely point and HTA should move on with the island caucus and the power committees.

Mr. Birch said they must help the legislators understand that the focus is on the steering committees who are built from the community members themselves and that they are leading the effort. The DMAP managers are only facilitating it and following their direction and executing the actions created by the community itself. He said that is the message he has been pushing out to the legislators. He said thankfully their island caucus allows him to speak to them every other month where he can explain things and make sure they are reminded who the steering committee members are regularly, that they are part of the community, and extensions of their constituents.

Chair Yuen concurred that it is critical to do those updates for all islands, and regularly like Hawai'i Island.

Mr. Ching had a two-part question: one for leadership and a second for the managers and directors. He said he heard that there are three- and five-year projects, and wanted to know if there are other problems or roadblocks that the committee can be made aware of, and asked what the next steps are to keep it moving past the three years, or five years as a succession plan.

Mr. De Fries asked Ms. Anderson to comment on the three-year schedule.

Ms. Anderson said when they started on the process of building the DMAPs they knew the plans were short term for three years to start. They felt three years was a good amount of time to see some things come to fruition, and at the end of the second year, they will re-evaluate all of the actions, where they are, and see where to move forward. She said they are trying to accomplish as much as they can in the three years. When the DMAP was being developed it was the start of COVID. Therefore, they needed to be flexible and assess the situation as they went. She said they are all a team and are always looking at progress.

Chair Yuen added that when they developed the concept, they kept it short, to three years, as they knew things would change over time, especially with COVID. They wanted to be able to update the plans soon in case something changed and they needed to shift, but said as they are starting to roll the actions out, and getting into the communities, they know some items will take a lot longer.

She said they know it is not an overnight fix, especially involving the communities as that process in itself will take time to come to solutions that are truly community based. However, it will be worth it in the end, establishing relationships and managing issues that come up in the communities. She said they know it will take the support at HTA to continually fund everything, including Destination Managers, and figuring out the next stage of how HTA is organized based on the bills that are coming through the legislature. They know they will need to change, and be flexible moving forward, as the worst thing they would want is to get all the communities on board and the programs start, and then have everything fail. She said it is difficult because of what is going on at the legislature but at the same time, she thinks everything that has happened has given them an opportunity to rethink how they want to move forward.

Mr. Downing thanked everyone for all the hard work but mentioned the problem he has after listening to Chair Yuen speak about the legislature, and how things could change. For three years, something could be cut off in a year and a half. He asked from the managers what their number one priority is, as Mr. Chun stated there is no prioritizing. He wanted to know what is

the most needed for all the islands with the funding. He said they must shorten the concept in that they need to produce something that the community, who has been a stakeholder, can see. He said 3-to 5-year plans of grandeur can be in place, but they need to come up with something of value for the community.

Chair Yuen said part of it is that the DMAPs are setting the priorities - and part of the funding was set aside for implementation on the hotspots, and then will move forward with that. But The funds will get encumbered based on a budget they set the previous year and what they will award the current year, so things will move forward, and the budget will get set.

She said because there are so many more, they are going to try take down the issues that came out the DMAPs as they go, and HTA is funding a lot of that. She said in the first year it was a small amount because Ms. Anderson and her team will have to encumber the funds by the end of the fiscal year. So there is not a lot of time left in the fiscal year to get the budget items encumbered for projects or contracts given our new procurement process.

She said the idea is that the plan can get relooked at at the end of year three, to see if anything shifts in terms of priorities, allowing the island managers to make the shift as things happen. She said it is on HTA to continue supporting the funding they have to help with all the actions they are identifying, and the steering committees are prioritizing. Next steps will involve coming up with budgets for the action items that need funding support from HTA and that is what Ms. Anderson will be presenting at the next Ho'okahua Hawai'i standing committee meeting.

Mr. Downing wanted to know each chapter's priorities are. He said if the steering committee is the driving force, then what was the steering committee's priorities. He has not heard much about beaches, and wanted to know from each area if the beaches are of any importance as there was no mentioning of beaches with an exception of Maui, which spoke about sunscreen and limiting snorkeling tours to Lāna'i. He further expressed the difficulty of implementation if only Trilogy is allowed to do so; they cannot remove Trilogy either as it will fight to stay as it has a docking system on Lāna'i.

Mr. Downing said he cares about his community, he wants to produce what the community wants and needs, to get their buy-in. He said the trust will come if HTA produce for them. He said the community is very anti-tourist at the moment and it is a hard one to gain their trust without proof.

Ms. Kanoho said they have got the priorities and will send them to Mr. Downing. She mentioned that beaches were an issue for them where they had concerns about visitors taking up all the parking for beaches before residents can get there. Ms. Kanoho said they are looking through the partnership with the County they have had for years, and said she appreciates the

the MOU, but as the mayor said they do it without an MOU, as it is a partnership. They are looking at how they better manage the parking situation, similar to Hā'ena, so that residents can show up and get parking.

She also mentioned the hotspots and how they better manage those areas, and they have a list and will send them to show what the hotspots are, and said they have been identified by the steering committee - a lot of this is through partnership.

She said the Kaua'i DMAP team has to work with the State as a lot of their areas of attractions are State land. In the partnership meeting on Friday, they will talk about how to better manage these areas and how tours can be more legal and appropriate, as they were having issues with illegal tours taking over areas that they should not be in. She said it is a balance to have commerce but also being pono at the same time.

Mr. Downing thanked Ms. Kanoho and said it is good for everyone, the legislature, community and the State of Hawai'i as a whole, to see what each island prioritizes are. He said if it is out there, there may be more ways to collaborate with other people that they do not even know about.

Ms. Kanoho also mentioned that some of their residents at Kōke'e did not know about the parking meter charges and they were confused, so they have to do more outreach to the islands for them to understand.

She said she appreciates what Mr. Chun at Alaska Airlines and some of the other visitor industry partners are doing to support them. She said it is going to take all of them together to share all the Mālama messages, as it cannot just be the visitor's bureau, or HTA by itself, it must be the partners they work with that must also share the messages. She mentioned a boat company that is doing the right thing for Kaua'i, even if it means losing business. She said they must also do outreach on their island as well with the residents to make sure they understand too, as some of them do not even know what DMAP is. She said they will be doing a meeting as the island chapters have done as well.

Ms. Kaiama said she supports what Ms. Kanoho was saying, and that the steering committee came out with the hotspot list that they are working on. They are trying to focus on what has been happening in the community and what positive outcomes they can work with, and then use that model to build consensus in other communities as they talk about other hotspots. She reiterated that priority is important for them as well, and as they have discussions and ideas with communities, they will find out what is important for their industry and how they prioritize what they will be doing.

Mr. Birch said they discovered through the process a great opportunity to work with many other partners, and they found out that through all the action items they laid out, entities like NaHHA, or the County's innovation grant, or different opportunities of resources are attacking all the action items simultaneously, and they ended up looking at the priorities with gaps, some of the ones where they can have the greatest influence on themselves and put financing towards it, that was not covered by some of the existing programs. He said they have to be very selective on their side and have to prioritize, but at the same time, they have action happening across the board.

Ms. Duong echoed what Ms. Kanoho and Mr. Birch said that when the steering committee put it together, it was not for them to put priority. Everything they put forward in the community was important for them. She said they had to come together to find out how they can make a difference in the community so they can see it and still move forward with the DMAP, all the action plans at the same time.

She said after all the advisory meetings that Ms. DeGaia attended with the community, they found that a big issue was hotspots on Maui, which she is attacking head on. She spoke about the Lānaʻi rebranding and it was important for the community to be seen in a different light. She mentioned, the importance of Mālama Cultural Park on Moloka'i, and if they could succeed to make that happen, it would be big for them and the industry.

Ms. Duong said that although the vice chair is asking for priorities one, two and three, there are things that are all important overall. She said the community and the steering committee is happy with what they have done. Ms. DeGaia said Ms. Duong articulated their top priorities. She added that the community as they know, want to see action, and it is important that they see how dedicated they are to realizing the actions, and it is important for them to recognize them as collaborators of positive change in the direction of Mālama Kuʻu Home that they are dedicated to at the island chapters, under the leadership of the HTA.

Ms. Schilling-Wheeler agreed with everything the sister islands said. She said they all narrowed it down to ten sub actions the steering committee wanted them to tackle. She said it was also about working together with community at their meeting and to remember that part of that is government. Being able to work with government in a concise way to see where they are at, and who was working on what, helped them in the prioritization.

She said all ten actions are key for Oʻahu, but pointed out that illegal rentals was a big issue. Hotspots, traffic and visitor behavior were also key, while not minimizing the other actions, such as buying local.

She reiterated that working with the government agencies, whether the County or the State, also plays a part in how they prioritize. She mentioned beaches and said they show up in the hotpots, even if they do not speak about them specifically due to the length of the presentation. She said every beach and beach park is different with different jurisdictions, so it is weeding through it all and understanding all the components to work through them with the communities.

Mr. Downing clarified that the only reason he spoke about prioritizing is for the budgetary concerns and that perhaps his questions should be addressed to the community, and how the community like to spend the budget. He said he understands what everyone is doing and sees their passion; he would like the community to see the good work the HTA has done, so that the legislature champions HTA, not shuts it down.

Chair Yuen said those are important points. She reiterated what Mr. Birch said about opening up so many connections with others to see what they are doing, and that they are working together so they do not duplicate efforts and can be as efficient with the funds that they have.

Ms. Shilling-Wheeler gave credit to HTA and all the Destination Managers. She said it is important to remember with actions and sub actions, that they are working with other agencies, so it is their kuleana as well to be involved, take over and do some of the actions along with them. She said HTA has led the path and is appreciative to all of them. She said it is also the opportunity to have some of the agencies better understand DMAP, and better understand the priorities.

Chair Yuen said it is been great to see how everyone has come together to work on it all.

Mr. Chun reiterated about prioritization and said the effort was massive and comprehensive. He said it is not just an HTA's effort, and they are working through and with everyone, and with other community stakeholders. He said it is important to take the update to the legislators and to other community stakeholders so they can see the big picture, and how the actions they are focused on fit in with the bigger picture.

He said with the three to five-year plan it is important to see what the next phases look like and the following year, and which ones they want to tackle in the particular timeframes, as the other feedback is that they do want to see what the funding amount is needed to make these things happen. He said in some ways, drawing out the map in a clear way, will help them to see what they will be losing out on if they do not get the funding. He said they have already gone into community to ask what they want done.

Chair Yuen said that was the whole idea, to put together budgets for a lot of the priorities so they can be informed on what they, as HTA can try to help fund. She said they are sorting through a lot of things, but said Ms. Anderson is taking the next step, working with them to get their budgets for the priorities so they can set up HTA approvals of the specific projects coming up.

Ms. Kanoho said one of the biggest problems is that a lot of them do the work, do the right thing for the community, do not brag about it. She said they need to communicate more on that so people see their efforts.

She mentioned her partnership with the County as being very close. She said Nalani in the Office of Economic Development took their team together and looked at the different plans, the general plan update, the work they are doing through DMAP and looked to see who was doing what and addressing which areas, and then where are the areas they will help uplift with their funding as they know other things are being handled through DMAPs.

She said it is important to know who will partner in which area to see which have not been addressed and step in, so she said it has to be a partnership with all the parties at the table to best understand the priorities to move forward. She said they are turning the corner on something that is great and thanked the HTA, Ms. Anderson and everyone else that has brought what is so important for tourism moving forward in a balanced way, to show the community they care.

Chair Yuen said education is also critical and that will come up in the next agenda item.

Mr. Birch thanked HTA for the flexibility in the program as it has been a moving target in the initial stages. He said when they started the steering committee on the Hawai'i Island, there was no budget, only a vision and a group of individuals from the community coming together to say what they thought would be the best to help develop the relationship between tourism and the community. He reiterated what Ms. Kanoho said about coming around the corner and they are still evolving and transitioning as they are going through the process. He said every day is a new experience and a learning opportunity for everyone.

There were no questions from the public.

Chair Yuen thanked everyone for the discussion and update they shared, and said they may make it a regular thing as it is helpful to hear all the wonderful things they are doing with the communities and helping them turn the industry into a more sustainable and regenerative industry. Mr. Ka'anā'anā recommended they could be timed with the regular industry updates.

4. Review, Discussion, and Recommendation on the Tourism Recovery and Marketing Plan for FY 2022

Chair Yuen said the next agenda item is the same as the tourism marketing plan that the Board approves every year and it provides more detail into the budget items they approved already, so a lot of the items will sound familiar, but it shows what the staff will be doing.

She said hopefully the committee members had a chance to look through it for HTA to make a recommendation to the full Board. She turned it over to Ms. Anderson and Mr. Ka'anā'anā.

Ms. Anderson gave an overview of how the Tourism Recovery and Marketing Plan (TRMP) related to the strategic plan.

Chair Yuen mentioned that it is required for their HRS, their law, to have a Tourism Marketing Plan, and the "Recovery" was added because of the funding from the ARPA funds. Ms. Anderson showed the strategic plan, which is the guide for their agency, overall strategic directives, and they have in the tourism marketing plan.

She said for the Year 2022 funds, they added the word "recovery" as fiscal 2022 is through ARPA funds and those are about recovery, part of their statute - HRS 201B-6. She said it gets approved by the Board every year and at the end of every year, they come with an annual report to the Legislature where they are reporting on their activities.

Mr. Ka'anā'anā mentioned the 54 pages in the TRMP reflects all programs across all four pillars. He said if there were questions about any particular line item of the budget that was already approved, there is a corresponding section in the TRMP that corresponds to the budget.

He said in the introductory section, there is information about who they are and what they do - legacy pieces of the plan that have always been included, and situational positioning of where they are at. He said it is important to understand that each of the sections of the TRMP for every market and project include a similar template, and there is an overview of each program, as well as the implementation. He said it identifies the staff responsible for the project, it identifies contractors working on the project, and the measurements and KPI's, or product that come out of each program. He asked if there were any questions.

Chair Yuen had some recommendations and thoughts. She said as they went through developing the strategic plan, they talked about updating the measures. She said the way the introduction reads, there is only the standard tourism statistics and there is a lot in the rest of the plan where they are tracking different measures - voluntourism numbers and shifts in other industry supporting tourism. She said she would like to see that brought to the front as most

people will read a few pages and stop, so said it would be helpful to highlight the changes in the measures they are moving forward with as it aligns with the shift in their Strategic Plan towards Mālama Hawai'i.

She said they must also talk about things the non-profits are doing so that it is measurable to bring out. She said a lot of it must be brought to the front so that it is clear that HTA is making the shift to a circular, regenerative economy, and figure out measures that also talk about their 'Āina Aloha commitment.

She said for the selection of grant awardees, to use the rubrics from 'Āina Aloha, the assessment tool, and how they select the awardees, and a lot of the metrics need to get showcased in the introduction, so that it is clear and highlighted. She said while it is the same thing they do every year; they want to show they are changing what they are doing and measuring different things that are more meaningful to the community as they want to see the shift in resident sentiment.

She also credited the idea from Mr. Zane about the cultivation of the leaders or cultural entrepreneurs, and that it would be great to have mentorship programs with our kupuna. She also said she would like to see more visitor education about endangered species, appropriate behavior and things to be mindful of.

Mr. Ka'anā'anā said it can be done and he thinks some of the those proposed by Chair Yuen are better suited to work into the fiscal 2023 year if they cannot for 2022, but, if possible, they can still fit them in. He said some of the struggles they had as a team in the performance measure or the KPIs that are identified in each section for each program, are programmatic goals as opposed to project goals, and questioned how they roll up the 80-something CEP program KPI's into something that is reportable and makes sense on a program level, as opposed to a project level. He said he needs help sorting through that.

Chair Yuen said they can talk offline to strategize. She reiterated Mr. Downing's concern of wanting something measurable to prove some good things that HTA are doing, and asked if Ms. Chun would have some tracking information they can use to take to the Legislature.

Mr. Ka'anā'anā spoke about the other pillars, as on page 9 it is traditional visitor industry KPI's, and wanted to make clear that every project that is being funded by HTA, has its own set of KPI's and they do track information, on an individual project basis if anyone wanted to see it.

Chair Yuen asked Ms. Anderson about her data sharing and asked if they can capitalize on the information somehow.

Ms. Anderson spoke about working with Mr. Ka'anā'anā and his team, to set up a way for the program staff to enter all the data with all the program indicators, so it can be pulled up, evaluated, and summarized, and said that is the purpose to make it more efficient. She asked Chair Yuen to send her document with the changes.

Mr. Downing agreed with Chair Yuen and said if he understands correctly, they must change the way they are doing things when they write the new plan, and show the pieces upfront so they get an idea that change is happening.

Mr. Ching agreed with everything that was said and mentioned that they need to market HTA better and said 54 pages is too long. He mentioned feedback he got when working with the Legislature is that short, digestible one-page document was appreciated.

Mr. Ka'anā'anā agreed with everything said and mentioned moving forward, what they must do is think about two separate documents. He said there is a lot of detail as they were asked for a lot of detail in the documents. Perhaps they can do an executive summary, keep it at 5 or 6 pages, or pair it with an infographic, and then the backup base document - 54 pages, can be there.

Chair Yuen said that would be great.

There were no questions from the public.

Mr. Ka'anā'anā asked if they can vote to recommend and wanted clarity on what their expectations for his team were.

Mr. Chun said as a workplan, he would move to recommend approving, with Chair Yuen's revisions. He said he agrees with what has been said about different products, and said the workplan with 54 pages is needed that the HTA staff follow as their plan. However, for the DMAPs and other things, they create executive summaries or something more digestible, so they can clear up and show the shift in the organization. He moved to recommend approval.

Mr. Kam seconded and said to Mr. Ka'anā'anā that he would like to see all the updates as well, as Chair Yuen presented.

Mr. Casson-Fisher did a roll call and the motion passed unanimously, all agreeing with recommendations.

5. Next Steps and Next Ho'okahua Standing Committee Meeting

Chair Yuen said it will be important to meet again the following month, so will set a date prior to March Board meeting. She opened it up to the members to see if they want to see anything else on the agenda for the next meeting.

Mr. Ching said the presentation with DMAPs has value, but Chair Yuen said it would not be every month, but the following month they are going to have NaHHA team present, but the DMAP update would be every six months perhaps.

Mr. Chun suggested tracking with the quarterly updates. Ms. Anderson suggested that when they present the progress reports, they could join with that, as well as the County or State agencies as well. Chair Yuen said it is a great idea.

Mr. Ka'anā'anā said it might be helpful, depending on time, to highlight one program per pillar, and he said it is important to dive in so the committee members can see what is happening. He said that if they ever want an update on a program, they could get into a rhythm of updating everyone on progress for a particular program or project on a monthly schedule.

Mr. Ching reiterated what Mr. Downing was asking, if they could get a good overview of something that could be a marketing idea for the committee members.

Chair Yuen asked Ms. Anderson about the budget for hotpots and asked if she would be ready by the next meeting to report on what the budget will go to for the current year. Ms. Anderson said she will have the list of priorities by March. Chair Yuen said it will be helpful for the committee to see what the funding will go towards, in terms of the selection. Chair Yuen said the committee members can reach out to her for any further discussion.

6. Adjournment

Chair Yuen asked for a motion to adjourn. Mr. Kam gave a motion and Mr. Ching seconded. Chair Yuen confirmed that nobody opposed.

Mr. Casson-Fisher concluded the meeting.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:59 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Sheillane Reyes

Recorder